ACTION MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

City Hall/Court House, 15 Kellogg Boulevard West, Lower Level - Room 40,

June 23, 2016

Present: Richard Dana, Michael Justin, Robert Ferguson, Bill Lightner, Matt Mazanec, Amy

Meller, David Riehle, Steve Trimble, David Wagner

Absent: Matt Hill (excused)

Staff Present: Christine Boulware, Allison Suhan, Alex Greenwood

PUBLIC HEARING/DESIGN REVIEW

I. Call to Order: 5:00 pm

II. Approval of the Agenda: Commissioner Justin moved to approve the agenda. Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion. **Motion passed 5-0.**

- **III.** Conflicts of Interest: None stated.
- IV. Public Hearings: Design Review
 - **A.** 260 Summit Avenue, Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District, by Jon Dietrich Hardline Concrete & Masonry, for an after-the-fact permit to demolish the sandstone entry steps and replace them with concrete with a blue stone texture and to replace the sandstone, side entry steps with concrete and tuck-point the adjacent wall. **File# 16-031** (Boulware, 266-6715)

Commissioner Meller moved to adopt the staff recommendations but removed condition #2, add all miscellaneous tuckpointing to condition #4, add a condition that no sealant shall be used, and form a Design Review Committee.. Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0. The Design Review Committee consists of Commissioners Meller, Ferguson, and Wagner.

B. 720 Seventh Street East – The Cambric, Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District, by Alex Gast – Cedar Creek Energy, for permits to install a 96 module, solar panel array on the rooftop. File# 16-032 (Suhan, 266-6643)

Commissioner Lightner moved to adopt the staff recommendations but removed condition #1, and add a condition that the applicant provide a view study from the northwest to ensure the solar panels are not visible. Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion. Motion passed 6-1 (Trimble).

V. New Business

A. Provide Public Comment on the EAW review for the extension of the two-story front porch of **771 Fairmount Avenue**, National Register and State Register Hill Historic District, by City of Saint Paul (RGU). (Suhan, 266-6643)

The HPC voted unanimously that the proposal to partially demolish the two-story front porch and construct a new two-story porch (extended by an additional 6 feet 4 inches) that doesn't convey a similar character and design intent is not appropriate given the significance of the structure and integrity. The HPC stated that the preferred solution is to reconstruct the porch as it currently exists. The HPC suggested as mitigation for the impacts of the loss of the character-defining feature (front porch), the second story porch be restored and remain in place (not expanded) as it is not a usable space and the first floor porch posts should also remain in place to convey the original porch configuration and footprint. While allowing the footprint of the first floor to only to be increased to a distance that is still consistent with setbacks of the neighborhood. The HPC discussed that the porch setbacks of the neighborhood should also be considered when expanding the footprint in order to remain compatible with the streetscape. These recommended mitigations will increase the reversibility of the project and lessen the loss of integrity of the structure and therefore the negative impact on the

historic structure and surrounding historic district.

- VI. Old Business
- VII. Chair Announcements
- VIII. Staff Announcements
 - **A.** Project Updates: Lowertown and Central Station Design Guidelines, Hill Historic District Resurvey, Hamline Midway Neighborhood Survey, Comp Plan Update 2018, EAW Reviews (NOTE: not all projects will have updates each month)
- IX. Motion to Adjourn: 6:43pm

Submitted by A. Greenwood.